

UT CAR CRASH SEMINAR

August 26, 2021

Important Cases in the Prosecution and Defense of UM/UIM Claims

Thomas A. Herald, THOMAS A. HERALD, PC (Carrollton)

Melissa A. Lorber, ENOCH KEVER PLLC (Austin)

Hot Topic at Texas Supreme Court

The Texas Supreme Court issued four opinions in Uninsured / Underinsured (UM/UIM) Cases in 2021:

- *Allstate Ins. Co. v. Irwin* (declaratory judgment / attorney's fees)
- *In re State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.* (abatement and separate trials)
- *In re USAA Gen. Indem. Co.* (corporate rep depositions)
- *In re USAA Gen. Indem. Co.* (consent to be bound)

The Supreme Court denied review in a fifth UM/UIM case:

- *In re State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co.* (extra-contractual claims)

Pleading a UM/UIM Case

Allstate Ins. Co. v. Irwin

No. 19-0885, 2021 WL 2021446 (Tex. May 21, 2021)

Affirmed in 5-4* decision

Majority by Justice Devine

Dissent by Chief Justice Hecht

*Justice Guzman was in the dissent and thereafter retired

Motion for rehearing filed on August 6, 2021

Allstate Ins. Co. v. Irwin

Holdings

1. An insurer's liability for benefits under a UM/UIM policy can be established in a declaratory judgment action under the Uniform Declaratory Judgment Act (UDJA).
2. The litigation between the insured and his UM/UIM insurer is to resolve "the underlying conditions precedent of liability and damages" (i.e., the car crash case), which is a coverage question.
3. Attorney's fees may be awarded under the UDJA .

Allstate Ins. Co. v. Irwin

Unanswered Questions

1. Can a UM/UIM claim only be litigated as a declaratory judgment action—and not as a breach of contract action?
2. Will the ability to recover fees in the car crash case impact extra-contractual litigation?
3. Attorney's fees must be reasonable and necessary (a fact question) and equitable and just (a legal question):
 - a. how/when will the issue of reasonable and necessary fees be litigated?
 - b. when will fees be considered equitable and just?

Find the full text of this and thousands of other resources from leading experts in dozens of legal practice areas in the [UT Law CLE eLibrary \(utcle.org/elibrary\)](https://utcle.org/elibrary)

Title search: Important Cases in the Prosecution and Defense of UM / UIM Cases

Also available as part of the eCourse

[Answer Bar: Taking on the Car Crash Client](#)

First appeared as part of the conference materials for the
2021 The Car Crash Seminar session

"Important Cases in the Prosecution and Defense of UM / UIM Cases"